

# Report of the 1<sup>st</sup> Workshop on Connecting the IOTC Science and Management Processes (SMWS01)

Phuket, Thailand, 25-27 July 2014



## DISTRIBUTION:

Participants in the Session Members of the Commission Other interested Nations and International Organizations FAO Fisheries Department FAO Regional Fishery Officers

#### **BIBLIOGRAPHIC ENTRY**

IOTC–SMWS01 2014. Report of the 1<sup>st</sup> Workshop on Connecting the IOTC Science and Management Processes (SMWS01), Phuket, Thailand, 25–27 July 2014. *IOTC–2014–SMWS01–R[E]: 10 pp.* 





The designations employed and the presentation of material in this publication and its lists do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Indian Ocean Tuna Commission (IOTC) or the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) of the United Nations concerning the legal or development status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

This work is copyright. Fair dealing for study, research, news reporting, criticism or review is permitted. Selected passages, tables or diagrams may be reproduced for such purposes provided acknowledgment of the source is included. Major extracts or the entire document may not be reproduced by any process without the written permission of the Executive Secretary, IOTC.

The Indian Ocean Tuna Commission has exercised due care and skill in the preparation and compilation of the information and data set out in this publication. Notwithstanding, the Indian Ocean Tuna Commission, employees and advisers disclaim all liability, including liability for negligence, for any loss, damage, injury, expense or cost incurred by any person as a result of accessing, using or relying upon any of the information or data set out in this publication to the maximum extent permitted by law.

#### Contact details:

Indian Ocean Tuna Commission Le Chantier Mall PO Box 1011 Victoria, Mahé, Seychelles Ph: +248 4225 494

Fax: +248 4224 364 Email: secretariat@iotc.org Website: http://www.iotc.org

#### **ACRONYMS**

BOBLME Bay of Bengal Large Marine Ecosystems project

IOTC Indian Ocean Tuna Commission

CMM Conservation and Management Measure (of the IOTC; Resolutions and Recommendations)

CPCs Contracting parties and cooperating non-contracting parties

CSIRO Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation, of Australia

MPF Meeting Participation Fund, of the IOTC

SMWS Science to Management Workshop (Workshop on Connecting the IOTC Science and Management

Processes

WPNT Working Party on Neritic Tunas, of the IOTC

#### **BACKGROUND**

At its 17<sup>th</sup> Session in 2013, the Commission agreed to further support capacity building activities among its Members by implementing adequate capacity building and support programmes, financially supported by Members through the Commission's budget, as well as through voluntary contributions by CPCs and other interested parties.

As a result, the IOTC Secretariat reached an agreement with BOBLME to co-finance a three day workshop 25–27 June, 2014 in Phuket, Thailand. The workshop occurred in the days prior to the 4<sup>th</sup> Session of the IOTC Working Party on Neritic Tunas (WPNT04) so that participants may attend both meetings for maximum cost effectiveness and to further build capacity among developing coastal state scientists who attend the WPNT.

The aims of the three day workshop were to:

- improve the level of comprehension among IOTC Members on how the scientific process informs the management of IOTC species and ecosystems
- increase the awareness of IOTC Members to their obligations, as stipulated in the Commissions' Conservation and Management Measures which are based on rigorous scientific advice
- Improve the decision making process within the IOTC.

The workshop covered the following core topics:

- Structure and functioning of the IOTC
- Current status of IOTC stocks
- Communicating IOTC science to managers
- Lessons to be learnt from other fisheries management structures
- How to interpret science advice as a manager
- Country level implications arising from stock assessment results and management options analyses
- How the Commission uses Science advice to develop Conservation and Management Measures
- Implications of current Conservation and Management Measures for CPCs
- Effects of poor compliance with IOTC requirements on the provision of scientific advice and management.

The **target audience** for the workshop were <u>national scientists and middle managers</u>, who support IOTC Commissioners from developing coastal states.

All participants to the WPNT04 were encouraged to attend the three day workshop, and those receiving financial support from the IOTC Meeting Participation Fund (MPF) were required to attend the SMWS01.

Please note that the documents available for the workshop will be posted to the IOTC website as soon as they are available: <a href="http://iotc.org/meetings/1st-workshop-connecting-iotc-science-and-management-processes">http://iotc.org/meetings/1st-workshop-connecting-iotc-science-and-management-processes</a>

The participation of developing coastal state CPCs of the IOTC was supported through the Capacity Building budget line of the IOTC budget for 2014 and through support from BOBLME.

The workshop was taught by Dr. David Wilson (Deputy Secretary/Science Manager, IOTC) Dr. Rishi Sharma (Fishery Officer – Stock Assessment, IOTC), Dr. Shijie Zhou (Invited Expert, CSIRO) and Dr. Chris O'Brien (Regional Coordinator, BOBLME). A total of 30 participants attended the workshop. A list of participants is provided at <u>Appendix I</u>.

## APPROACH AND WORKSHOP CONTENT

The workshop was run in the format of lectures/presentation followed by case studies, open discussion and practical exercise by participants and revolved around the following four key topics:

- 1) Background to IOTC & the management of highly migratory species
- 2) How scientific advice is generated and effectively communicated (Theory and practice)
- 3) The decision making process based on advice received (Theory and practice)
- 4) National implementation and compliance with decisions of the Commission

The Agenda is provided at <u>Appendix II</u>, and all of the presentations made are available from the IOTC website: http://iotc.org/meetings/1st-workshop-connecting-iotc-science-and-management-processes

# **WORKSHOP EFFECTIVENESS**

A survey was designed for feedback at the end of the workshop (Appendix III) and the results are summarised in Appendix IV.

The overall rating for the SMWS01 were as follows:

Rating	Number of responses	% score	
Not relevant	0	0	
Satisfactory	1	3.85	
Good	9	34.62	
Excellent	11	42.31	
Outstanding	5	19.22	
Total	26	100	

## **FUTURE WORKSHOPS**

As required by IOTC Resolution 14/03 On *enhancing the dialogue between fisheries scientists and managers*, the SMWS series will continue into the future, with the 2<sup>nd</sup> Workshop on Connecting the IOTC Scince and Management Process scheduled to be held in September, 2014 in Cape Town, South Africa.

The SMWS02 will repeat much of the SMWS01 to participants from the western Indian Ocean CPCs, with refined course material and objectives.

# **APPENDIX I** LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

**Facilitators** 

Dr. David Wilson

Deputy Secretary/Science Manager Indian Ocean Tuna Commission Email: david.wilson@iotc.org

Dr. Rishi **Sharma** 

Fishery Officer (Stock Assessment) Indian Ocean Tuna Commission Email: rishi.sharma@iotc.org

Dr Shijie **Zhou** CSIRO, Australia

Email: shijie.zhou@csiro.au

Mr Chris Obrien **BOBLME** 

Email: chris.obrien@boblme.org

**Participants** 

Mr Reza Naderi Abbaspour Iran Fisheries Organization, Iran Email: r naderimail@yahoo.com

Dr E.M. Abdussamad

Central Marine Fisheries Research Institute, Government of India Email: emasamad2@yahoo.com

Mr Mohamed Ahusan

Marine Research Centre, Ministry of Fisheries and Agriculture, Maldives Email: mahusan@mrc.gov.mv

Mr Sonthaya Boonsuk

Saton marine Fisheries Station Email: sonya.boo2007@gmail.com

Mr Osvaldo Chacate

National Fisheries Research Institute, Mozambique

Email: chacatemz@gmail.com

Ms DMH **Damayanthi** 

Department of Fisheries and Aquatic

Resources, Sri Lanka

Email: damayanthi.harsha@gmail.com (IIP), Mozambique

Ms Andra Hennedige Sumana

Eddiriweera

Sri Lanka

Email: ahsediriweera@gmail.com

Ms Effarina Mohd Faizal

Department of Fisheries, Malaysia

Email:

effarinamohdfaizal@yahoo.com

Mr Rodney Govinden

Seychelles Fishing Authority Seychelles

Email: rgovinden@sfa.sc

Ms Piyawan Hussadee

Department of Fisheries, Thailand Email: pywm88@gmail.com

Ms Thumawadee Jaiven

Marine Fisheries Research and Development Center, Thailand Email: njaiyen@hotmail.com

Mr Sallehudin **Jamon** 

Capture Fisheries Division, Fisheries Research Institute- Kampung Acheh, 32000 Sitiawan Perak, Malaysia

Email: sallehudin jamon@dof.gov.my Development Center

Mr Irwan Jatmiko

Research Institute for Tuna Fisheries,

Indonesia

Email: irwan.jatmiko@gmail.com

Mr Ahmed Riyaz Jauharee

Marine Research Centre, Ministry of Fisheries and Agriculture, Maldives Email: arjauharee@mrc.gov.mv

Dr Farhad Kaymaram

Iranian Fisheries Research Organization Email:

farhadkaymaram@gmail.com

Mr Muhammad Moazzam Khan

WWF-Pakistan

Email: mmoazzamkhan@gmail.com

Mr Johnson Grayson Mshana Sokoine University of Agriculture

Tanzania

Email: mshanajohn1@yahoo.com

Mr Rui Jorge Mutombene

National Fisheries Research Institute

Email: ruimutombene@gmail.com

Mr Stephen Ndegwa

State Department of Fisheries, Kenya

Email: ndegwafish@yahoo.com

Dr Tom Nishida (SC Chair)

National Research Institute of Far Seas

Fisheries (NRIFSF)

Email: tnishida@affrc.go.jp

Ms Praulai Nootmorn

Marine Fisheries Research and Technological Development Institute,

Thailand

Email: nootmorn@yahoo.com

Ds Chintha Perera

National Aquatic Resources Research and Development Agency, Sri Lanka

Email: t\_chintha@yahoo.com

Ms Patcharee **Puntuleng** 

Marine Fishery Research and

Email: p\_puntuleng@hotmail/.com

Dr Prathibha Rohit

Central Marine Fisheries Research Institute, Ministry of Agriculture,

Government of India

Email: rohitprathi@yahoo.co.in

Dr Chalit **Sa-nga-ngam** 

Andaman Sea Fisheries Research and Development center Phuket, Thailand

Email: chalitster@gmail.com

Ms Ririk Kartika Sulistyaningsih

Research Institute for Tuna Fisheries (RITF), Indonesia

Email:

rk.sulistyaningsih11@gmail.com

Prof Ali Suman

Research Institute For Marine

Fisheries Indonesia

Email: alisuman 62@yahoo.com

Mr Kritsada Thongsila

Marine Fisheries Research and

Development Center

Email: ktda2519@gmail.com

Dr Smith Thummachua

Department of Fisheries, Thailand

Email: thuma98105@yahoo.com

Ms Suwantana **Tossapornpitakkul** Southern Marine Fisheries Research

and Development Center

Email: tsuwantana@yahoo.com

Thailand Department of Fisheries support staff:

Ms Panida **Chalee**Marine Fisheries Research and
Development Center, Thailand
Email: <a href="mailto:nidacha@yahoo.com">nidacha@yahoo.com</a>

Ms Issarapon **Jithlang**Marine Fisheries Research and
Development Center, Thailand
Email: <a href="mailto:issaraponi@yahoo.com">issaraponi@yahoo.com</a>

# **APPENDIX II**

# AGENDA – 1ST WORKSHOP ON CONNECTING THE IOTC SCIENCE AND MANAGEMENT PROCESSES (SMWS01)

**Date:** 25–27 June 2014 **Location:** Phuket, Thailand

**Venue:** Novotel Phuket Resort, Patong, Phuket, Thailand

**Time:** 09:00 - 17:00 daily

Facilitator: Dr. David Wilson; Co-Facilitators: Dr. Chris O'Brien; Dr. Rishi Sharma; Dr. Shijie Zhou

- 1. OPENING OF THE MEETING AND ARRANGEMENTS FOR THE WORKSHOP (IOTC Secretariat/ BOBLME)
- 2. THE STRUCTURE AND FUNCTIONING OF THE IOTC PROCESS: Overview (Dr. David Wilson: IOTC Secretariat)
- 3. SIMPLE STOCK ASSESSMENT METHODS AND INDICATORS (Dr. Rishi Sharma: IOTC Secretariat; Dr. Shiji Zhou: Invited Expert for WPNT04)
  - 3.1 Basic models
  - 3.2 The basic data types used by simple models; effects of problems in these data types
  - 3.3 Effects of errors (process and measurement) in the assessment
  - 3.4 Review of a typical analysis: data issues, CPUE analysis, basic kinds of assessments
  - 3.5 Discussion and practical session
- **4. DATA-POOR APPROACHES TO DETERMINE STOCK STATUS** (Dr. Rishi Sharma: IOTC Secretariat & Dr. Shiji Zhou: Invited Expert for WPNT04)
  - 4.1 Use of management advice in the formulation of joint management actions in the presence of uncertainty: basic introduction
  - 4.2 Precautionary approach: reference points and harvest control rules
  - 4.3 Discussion and practical session
- 5. THE WEIGHT-OF-EVIDENCE FRAMEWORK (Dr. David Wilson: IOTC Secretariat)
  - 5.1 Introduction to the Weight-of-Evidence Framework
  - 5.2 <u>Case studies</u> on how to apply the framework
  - 5.3 Communicating the Weight-of-Evidence results to managers and policy makers within the IOTC
  - 5.4 Discussion and practical session
- 6. DEVELOPMENT AND EFFECTIVE COMMUNICATION OF SCIENTIFICALLY-BASED MANAGEMENT ADVICE (Dr. David Wilson & Dr. Rishi Sharma: IOTC Secretariat; Dr. Chris O'Brien: BOBLME))
  - 6.1 Use of management advice in the formulation of joint management actions in the presence of uncertainty: basic introduction
  - 6.2 Precautionary approach: reference points and harvest control rules
  - 6.3 What are acceptable levels of risk for management?
  - 6.4 Constructing robust harvest control rules: Management Strategy Evaluation
  - 6.5 Communicating effectively the effects of uncertainty
  - 6.6 Implementation of management actions including data collection
  - 6.7 <u>Case studies</u> on how the IOTC working parties develop management advice: Species executive summaries
  - 6.8 Discussion and practical session
- 7. IOTC CONSERVATION AND MANAGEMENT MEASURES (Dr. David Wilson & Dr. Rishi Sharma: IOTC Secretariat)
  - 7.1 Defining an IOTC Conservation and Management Measure
  - 7.2 <u>Case studies</u> of how the Commission has used and not used scientifically-based management advice in the development of its Conservation and Management Measures
  - 7.3 Pitfalls of waiting too long or being too quick to provide scientifically-based management advice
  - 7.4 Discussion and practical session
- 8. IMPLEMENTATION OF MANAGEMENT ACTIONS (Dr. David Wilson & Dr. Rishi Sharma: IOTC Secretariat)
  - 8.1 Obligations of IOTC Members in the implementation of IOTC CMMs
  - 8.2 Effects of poorly implemented management actions
  - 8.3 Decision making processes and implementation within the IOTC
  - 8.4 Discussion and practical session

# APPENDIX III SMWS01: COURSE SURVEY

Please answer the questions as to relevance (please circle)

1.	What is your role within your organisation?  Manager Policy maker Research Scientist/Biologist Academia							
2.	Did you find this course useful?  1. Not relevant  2. Somewhat relevant  3. Relevant  4. Highly Relevant							
3.	Would you want another course as a follow up in more depth?  1. No 2. Unsure 3. Maybe. 4.Yes 5. Undoubtedly Yes							
4.	Would you want a course dealing with intricate details of stock assessment to be the focus?  1. No 2. Unsure 3. Maybe. 4.Yes 5. Undoubtedly Yes							
5.	Would more exercises/practicals make some of this material easier to understand?  1. No 2. Unsure 3. Maybe. 4.Yes 5. Undoubtedly Yes							
6.	Is there a need for more workshops and trainings of this sort in the region?  1. Yes  2. No  3. Maybe							
7.	Please rate each of the sections of the use in terms of how useful you found it to be:							
	Agenda Item 2: The structure and functioning of the IOTC process: overview 1. Not relevant 2. Satisfactory 3. Good. 4. Excellent 5. Outstanding							
	Agenda Item 3: Simple stock assessment methods and indicators  1. Not relevant 2. Satisfactory 3. Good. 4. Excellent 5. Outstanding							
	Agenda Item 4: Data-poor approaches to determine stock status 1. Not relevant 2. Satisfactory 3. Good. 4. Excellent 5. Outstanding							
	Agenda Item 5: The weight-of-evidence framework  1. Not relevant   2. Satisfactory   3. Good.   4. Excellent   5. Outstanding							
	Agenda Item 6: Development and effective communication of scientifically-based management advice 1. Not relevant 2. Satisfactory 3. Good. 4. Excellent 5. Outstanding							
	Agenda Item 7: IOTC Conservation and Management Measures 1. Not relevant 2. Satisfactory 3. Good. 4. Excellent 5. Outstanding							
	Agenda Item 8: Implementation of management actions 1. Not relevant 2. Satisfactory 3. Good. 4. Excellent 5. Outstanding							
8.	Overall course rating.							
	1. Not relevant 2. Satisfactory 3. Good. 4. Excellent 5. Outstanding							

Other comments:

# APPENDIX IV SMWS01: SURVEY RESULTS

Survey question			Response		
1) What is your role within your organization?	Manager = 3	Policy maker = 7	Scientist/ researcher = 15	Academia = 1	Other = 0
2) Did you find this course useful?	Not relevant = 1	Somewhat relevant = 4	Relevant $= 6$	Highly relevant = 8	No response = 13
3) Would you want another course as a follow up in more depth?	No = 0	Unsure = 1	Maybe = 3	Yes = 12	Undoubtedly Yes = 10
4) Would you want a course dealing with intricate details of stock assessment to be the focus?	No = 1	Unsure = 0	Maybe = 4	Yes = 12	Undoubtedly Yes = 9
5) Would more exercises/practicals make some of this material easier to understand?	No = 0	Unsure = 0	Maybe = 4	Yes = 13	Undoubtedly Yes = 9
6) Is there a need for more workshops and trainings of this sort in the region?	Yes = 25	No = 0	Maybe = 1		
7) Please rate each of the sections of the use in terms of how useful you found it to be:					
Agenda Item 2: The structure and functioning of the IOTC process: overview	Not relevant $= 0$	Satisfactory = 3	Good = 15	Excellent = 8	Outstanding = 0
Agenda Item 3: Simple stock assessment methods and indicators	Not relevant = 0	Satisfactory = 1	Good = 16	Excellent = 7	Outstanding = 2
Agenda Item 4: Data-poor approaches to determine stock status	Not relevant = 0	Satisfactory = 2	Good = 18	Excellent = 6	Outstanding = 0
Agenda Item 5: The weight-of-evidence framework	Not relevant $= 0$	Satisfactory = 0	Good = 17	Excellent = 8	Outstanding = 1
Agenda Item 6: Development and effective communication of scientifically-based management advice	Not relevant = 0	Satisfactory = 3	Good = 10	Excellent = 8	Outstanding = 4
Agenda Item 7: IOTC Conservation and Management Measures	Not relevant $= 0$	Satisfactory = 3	Good = 9	Excellent = 10	Outstanding = 4
Agenda Item 8: Implementation of management actions	Not relevant = 0	Satisfactory = 2	Good = 14	Excellent = 6	Outstanding = 4
8) Overall course rating.	Not relevant = 0	Satisfactory = 1	Good = 9	Excellent = 11	Outstanding = 5

### Other comments (from participants on survey):

There may be some similar level workshops in some countries, especially where management measures are well understood and being implemented.

More time is required for practical sessions to enable trainees to apply the theory in practice. Much time has been spent on theoretical part but only few hours was used in practical.

This workshop is very useful for me as a new comment for this field. Si it is great experience.

Capacity building in the data analysis areas (catch & effort, and size, CPUE etc). This will improve the quality of papers and science at working party meetings.

Thank you for the training. Hopefully there will be another training.

Perhaps we need workshops of four days which would allow better discussion of some important issues. The group discussion would be [expanded] when possible to give a chance to present the results in powerpoint for better sharing the ideas in most of the exercises.

A course on 'R' statiscial analysis will be useful to increase the capacity of the scientists in the region.

Dealt in detail about the Reference Points, which are the major parameters for arriving at stock conditions and formulating advice. However, the estimation of these parameters from the available datasets, and with the CPC's or scientists were not taught. It should be taken care of in the next workshop.

I think the workshop is very good, its improving my understanding on data analysis and policy processes in the IOTC. However, the time is too short. I suggest that every section need to include the practice/activity, especially for data (using real data). I recommend that IOTC upgrade the ability of the members by conducting advanced training for data analysis and presentation. Thank you very much for IOTC and BOBLME and all the presenters.

The workshop was thoroughly planned and was an eye opener on several existing issues in the IOTC region. The IOTC must come out with detailed working manuals for stock assessment and resources with examples on plotting KOBE and interpreting them so that the participants from different IOTC CPC countries can follow these methods and for uniform pattern of estimating the stock status.

The problem in coastal countries could be written in two different categories (1 – Fisheries department and 2 – scientists/researchers). 1) The fisheries department goes his way and it is not important for them stock assessment and advices or recommendations of research. 2) It is the care that fisheries organization should be focal point but I think that researchers should have the right to attend and give their ideas. So it is the IOTC duty to cover this problem. 3) to give examples and explain for example KOBE plot from beginning step by step is more comprehensive than give a lot of examples without understanding the briefs. 4) Working Parties is a meeting for research officer not experts from fisheries departments in my opinion, experts of fisheries departments could attend in some working parties such as WPP on Data Collection and Statistics.